

Meeting Title	Board of Directors		
Date	13.9.18	Agenda item	Bo.9.18.36

CONFIRMED MINUTES OF WORKFORCE COMMITTEE MEETING 30 MAY 2018

Presented by	Chair of the Workforce Committee		
Author	N/A		
Lead Director	Pat Campbell, Director of HR		
Purpose of the paper	To present the Board with the confirmed minutes of the Workforce Committee 30 May 2018		
Key control	This paper provides minutes of the meeting of a Board Committee that assures the strategic objective to - Be in the top 20% of employers in the NHS		
Action required	To receive		
Previously discussed at/ informed by	Workforce Committee		
Previously approved at:	Committee/Group	Date	
	Workforce Committee	25 July	
Recommendation			
The Board of Directors is requested to note the content of the minutes and the escalations and actions identified			

WORKFORCE COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES, ACTIONS & DECISIONS

Date:	Wednesday 30 May 2018	Time:	11:00-13:00
Venue:	Conference Room, Field House, Bradford Royal Infirmary	Chair:	Selina Ullah, Non-Executive Director
Present:	Non-Executive Directors: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Ms Selina Ullah, Non-Executive Director (SU) Mr Jon Prashar, Non-Executive Director (JP) Ms Pauline Vickers, Non-Executive Director (PV) Executive Directors: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Mr Bryan Gill, Medical Director (BG) Ms Pat Campbell, Director of Human Resources (PC) Ms Karen Dawber, Chief Nurse (KD) Mrs Sandra Shannon, Chief Operating Officer (SSh) 		
In Attendance:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Ms Jacqui Maurice, Head of Corporate Governance (JM) Mrs Samantha King, Minute Taker (SK) 		

No.	Agenda Item	Action
W.5.18.1	Apologies for Absence	
	There were no apologies.	
W.5.18.2	Declaration of Interests	
	There were no declarations of interest.	
W.5.18.3	Minutes of the meeting held on 28 March 2018	
	The minutes of the meeting held on 28 March 2018 were accepted as an accurate record following an amendment to item W.3.18.7 to change the phrase 'static medical locums are' to 'medical locum usage is'.	
W.5.18.4	Matters Arising	
	<p>The Committee noted the following with regard to the items on the action log.</p> <p>W.3.18.4 'Harassment and Bullying' dashboard indicator. PC asked the Committee to note that the progress highlighted in the action log was not accurate. She advised that discussions had taken place on what a meaningful indicator would be and this had proved difficult to define. The Committee noted that there were questions included in the staff survey however the responses could only be monitored on an annual basis. PC suggested that the indicator could include the number of</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - complaints logged - complaints resolved informally - formal investigations and outcomes. <p>Due to the small number of complaints it would be appropriate to include within the dashboard on a six monthly cycle. The Committee agreed.</p> <p>BG asked the Committee to note that harassment and bullying issues raised by</p>	Director of Human Resources

No.	Agenda Item	Action
	<p>Junior Doctors in training would be picked up separately as the doctors do not tend to make use of the formal policy reporting routes. The Committee discussed in detail the avenues that doctors did use as well as the initiatives being put in place to embed structural approaches to address and challenge unacceptable behaviours and, encourage behaviours aligned with the Trust's values.</p> <p>W.3.18.5: Board Assurance Framework. Work is still progressing with regard to the review of the Board Assurance Framework. An update will be shared with the next meeting of the Committee.</p> <p>W.3.18.6 - Workforce Committee Dashboard: Information with regard to the Staff Friends and Family Tests was included in the dashboard at agenda item W.5.18.5. <u>Action concluded.</u></p> <p>W.3.18.7 - Workforce Report: Updates that cover the NHSI Pilot Study, Pharmacy and, Sickness/Turnover results for clinical and non-clinical staff have been included in the Workforce report at agenda item W.5.18.6. <u>Action concluded.</u></p> <p>W.3.18.10 - Gender Pay Gap: The revised wording of front cover sheet under Equality Impact/Implications would be addressed as part of the review of all Committee and Board cover sheets currently being undertaken by the Director of Governance and Corporate Affairs. <u>Action concluded.</u></p> <p>W.1.18.3 - Minutes of the meeting held on 29 November 2017. The required amendment has been completed. <u>Action concluded.</u></p>	
W.5.18.5	Workforce Committee Dashboard	
	<p>SU requested that the Committee consider the Board Assurance Framework as part of this agenda item.</p> <p>PC asked the Committee to note that with regard to the BAF, the Q4 (2017/18) position had been presented at the Board of Directors but was not reflected in this Workforce Committee Dashboard. She reminded the Committee that the Q4 updated assurance level showed both positive and negative assurance and as such the risk appetite for Q1 (2018/19) would be changing. The Committee noted that in Q1 the overall ratings for Appraisals is amber and; Sickness had moved from red to amber. This was an annual target and so the work programme started again on 1 April with a target of 4% by 31 March 2019.</p> <p>The Committee discussed the dashboard in detail and noted that;</p> <p><u>Sickness Performance Data:</u> Divisions were in receipt of monthly information which included the associated financial costs to their areas. Additional detailed information was provided to Divisions which showed the benefits of improving sickness levels to patient care. Divisions were also made aware of the investments being made in staff health and wellbeing.</p> <p><u>Appraisal figures.</u> PC advised that the Divisions were in receipt of high level summaries advising of their Divisional performance however, they were also in receipt of detailed directorate and specialty level performance information which had helped to focus attention on performance. The committee noted</p>	

No.	Agenda Item	Action
	<p>that Estates and Facilities remained one of the best performers. PC advised that discussions had recently been held at the Executive Management Team meeting with regard to further improving the position and stringently managing appraisal performance.</p> <p><u>Staff Friends and Family Tests</u> – PC asked the committee to note that the dashboard had been updated with the Q4 position. PC advised caution with regard to the interpretation of the results as only 259 members of staff had responded in Q4 so it was difficult to read too much into the results. With regard to the Q3 results; 1,400 staff had responded and 71% of staff would recommend the Trust as a place for treatment. In terms of working at the Trust, 61% of staff would recommend working here. Both positions were improved for BTHFT. PC advised that the next staff friends and family survey would be undertaken towards the end of June for Q1 and consideration was being given to the methods to be put in place for collecting the information as previously, better responses were received from direct contact with staff. JP referred to the Council of Governors meeting in April and commented that the Governors had noted the vacancies at band 8 and were keen to understand what the Trust was doing to encourage band 7s into those roles. PC advised that this work was being progressed through the Diversity Work stream and asked the Committee to note that Pauline Garnett, Staff Governor would be joining the group.</p> <p><u>Sickness.</u> The Committee noted the year to date sickness levels. Lower in month sickness had been recorded. There had been a lot of work taking place around managing absence.</p> <p>The committee discussed the initiatives in place to address factors that might affect sickness levels such as impairment related sickness and discriminatory practices. PC advised that this was being addressed through work being undertaken by the Head of Equality and Diversity with the staff networks. It was agreed that JP and PC would meet to discuss impairment related sickness in further detail. The Committee also discussed other interventions available to support staff particularly through occupational health and the fast track procedures in place to enable staff to access services here at BTHFT if required.</p> <p><u>Nursing Establishment:</u> KD asked the Committee to note that the nursing shifts filled showed an improved position over previous months. This was due to a number of factors, which included a slight reduction in sickness absence and the reduction in the number of escalation beds.</p> <p>The Committee noted that following the staffing review there were more health care assistants and trainee nurses which was shown in the figures presented in the report. The main driver has however, been the reduced bed occupancy. BG commented on the improved situation with regard to the Stroke Team where the staffing situation was seeing improvements.</p> <p><u>Staff in Post and use of Agency Staff:</u> PC advised that there had been little change to the level of staff in post. There had been an increase in the number of healthcare assistants and the use of agency staff fell during April by up to 40 full time equivalents across all staff groups. BTHFT has been able to make substantive appointments. PC advised that sessions had been held with</p>	

No.	Agenda Item	Action
	<p>managers to support better use of e-rostering which has also supported a reduction in shift requests.</p> <p><u>Staff Turnover:</u> The Committee noted that there was a slight increase reported for April however the Trust remained relatively stable with regard to staff turnover. Nursing turnover, although higher than this time last year, actually saw a reduction.</p> <p>SU thanked PC for the comprehensive overview of the dashboard and the Committee for the detailed discussions.</p>	
W.5.18.6	Workforce Report	
	<p>It was noted that many of the items had been covered in the discussion on the workforce dashboard. However PC provided the following updates in relation to the following items from agenda item W.5.18.4 Matters Arising:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - NHSI Pilot Study: BTHFT was ready to go however NHSI had put this on hold whilst it considered issues of consent in relation to GDPR. - Pharmacy: The committee was asked to note the detailed update provided with in the report which included coverage of the registered posts, recruitment and retention and apprenticeships. - PC asked the committee to note the detailed picture provided regarding Consultant Recruitment where the Trust has been doing well in comparison to neighbouring Trusts. <p>BG asked the Committee to note that recruiting Consultants in Dermatology was an issue faced by Trusts across the district. He advised that WYAAT had recognised that a more sustainable model for Dermatology was required however discussions were in their infancy and plans had not yet been sufficiently developed.</p> <p>PC referred to issues related to overseas doctors who need tier 2 licences. She described the process in place whereby the Home Office had put in place a quota for each. NHS employers were involved in lobbying the Home Office along with the support of individual MPs – this was not yet having an impact. The sector was worried about the pressures that would come in August. SU suggested the Trust might think about lobbying the local MPs itself to add to the pressure.</p> <p>BG asked the committee to note the new format in use for reporting on mandatory training. He asked the Committee to note the breakdowns provided with regard to refresher training that existing staff have been through at the Trust and the distinction between core and high-priority compliance. BG advised that further detail will be provided within the next report. This he stated provided a better picture than previously with regard to new starters.</p> <p>The Committee noted the report.</p>	
W.5.18.7	Update on Implementation and Maximisation of the use of the Apprenticeship Levy.	
	PC advised that the original request for this report had been from the Audit and	

No.	Agenda Item	Action
	<p>Assurance Committee. The report is intended to provide an update in terms of the Trust's current position.</p> <p>PC advised that starting in April 2017 all UK employers in the public and private sector with a pay bill of over £3 million have had to contribute to the apprenticeship levy (0.5% of their annual pay bill). BTHFT has an annual £910,705 Net Levy Payment and is required to achieve a public sector target of 133 apprenticeship starts annually.</p> <p>The Committee discussed the focus that needed to be placed on securing management buy-in for the apprenticeship model and ensuring that recruitment plans are finalised.</p> <p>PC stated that the benefits are already there to be seen at the Trust with proven examples of apprentice appointments being made in areas such as engineering and pharmacy. She referred to the 'trailblazing projects' such as the ones in development in Theatres and Neonatology that the Trust had invested in.</p> <p>The Committee noted that apprenticeships increased from 78 to 124 in 2017/18 and that the plan for 2018/19 was for 182 apprenticeship starts across 12 apprenticeship standards. PC advised that this would fully utilise our levy plus generate a saving of £49k if recruitment plans were fully realised. The Committee were keen to explore what might be achieved through a much broader approach to integrated work force development; which might open up access to regional development funds. Shared apprenticeship schemes were a work strand through the Airedale, Wharfedale and Craven Integrated Programme Board. SU stated that this could significantly support the delivery of our own strategy in terms of expanding our local recruitment, recruiting more young people and, maximising career pathways.</p> <p>SU thanked PC for the report.</p>	
W.5.18.8	People Strategy Annual Plans 2018/19	
	<p>The Committee discussed in detail the high-level People Strategy Year 2 Work Plan. SU commented that of note to the Committee is the recognition that the workforce in five to ten years' time will look very different from the one we have now. One of the challenges identified is how to encourage staff to embrace technology so they are comfortable and engaged with it and the Committee was clear as it concluded its discussion that there was a need to step out of the comfort zone and up the risk appetite by consciously making those choices to embrace technology.</p>	
W.5.18.9	Annual Staff Survey Action Plan	
	<p>PC presented the report for information. She stated that the plan has been agreed with the Executive Management Team as they are responsible for driving improvements. PC referred to the recent Board session which highlighted the staff survey priorities. It was noted that an increase in staff engagement to support improvements was a top priority. BG commented on the good work undertaken by the Head of Organisational Development as part of the 'Work as One' week. It was noted that the Committee would receive updates on engagement as part of future reports covering progress in relation</p>	

No.	Agenda Item	Action
	to the annual staff survey action plan.	
W.5.18.10	April 2018 Quarterly Board Report – Guardian of Safe Working Hours doctors and dentists in training.	
	<p>BG asked the Committee to note the time period covered by the report. He drew attention to the following key points:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Exceptions continue to be reported with regard to Obstetrics and gynaecology trainees however changes to their shift patterns are now in place and being monitored. - In order to be compliant; the Haematology Senior Trainee rota is not workable without additional personnel which was at the time of writing the report provided by locums. BG advised that a revised rota is now in place utilising a different model of working and the trust is now compliant. - Exception reporting process is now being embedded. - Junior Doctor Forum is well attended. - The Director of Education will be reviewing the lost training opportunities and provide an update to BG. <p>The Committee noted the report.</p>	
W.5.18.11	Nurse staff data publication March and April 2018	
	<p>KD provided a summary of the paper provided. The committee noted the detailed discussion that had taken place under the 'Workforce Dashboard'. KD asked the Committee to note that;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The figures for March reflected a peak in the number of escalated beds and higher sickness absence. KD commented that there was low morale amongst staff who reported 'feeling tired' and this was reflected in the numbers. - Staff were covering more areas but there was no evidence of harm. - April saw improvements in sickness absence, less bed escalation, improved morale and less busy shifts. <p>SU asked if there had been an impact due to the measles outbreak. KD stated that this would show in the next month's report. A number of staff had contracted measles and, a number of Doctors and Nurses did not attend work as they could not provide any proof of immunity.</p> <p>SU thanked KD for the report.</p>	
W.5.18.12	Freedom to Speak Up Annual Report (incl Q4 report) 2017/18	
	<p>KD advised that this was the first annual report on Freedom to Speak Up which was considered by the Quality Committee. The Workforce Committee also received the report due to the number of concerns raised over the year that relate to workforce. The Committee noted and discussed the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The first full year's data on Freedom to speak up (FTSU). - The number of FTSU concerns raised in 2017/18. - The consultation that will take place on the planned revisions to the Bullying and Harassment policy. The revisions include the inclusion of learning from the FTSU investigations. - The new requirement, from May 2018, for the Board to self-assess against the national FTSU standards. 	

No.	Agenda Item	Action
	<p>- The additional training requirements for the Guardians and Associate Guardians.</p> <p>The Committee discussed in detail the concerns that had been raised. KD stated that staff had been brave in bringing these concerns forward and investigations have been undertaken and action taken. Key for the Committee is that the Trust adopts a zero tolerance approach to bullying and harassment. The Director of HR and Head of Equality are currently incorporating the findings from the Freedom to Speak Up annual report and the staff survey into the revised bullying and harassment policy which will be circulated for consultation. Workshops are planned in tandem with the launch to embed the policy and making absolutely clear that such behaviours will not be tolerated. PC also discussed the values workshops which were being rolled out across the Trust. The Committee drew correlations with the findings from the Staff Survey with regard to bullying and harassment and, noted that new Staff Advocates had now been trained and would be accessible to staff as a support.</p> <p>With regard to the new Guidance the Committee recommends that this forms part of a Board development session during the next quarter.</p>	
W.5.18.13	Development Session – Best Practice	
	<p>SU commented on the broader horizon scanning piece discussed under a previous agenda item. It was agreed that the paper to be presented on future roles would cover the 'development session' element on the agenda.</p> <p>SU invited members of the Committee to put forward future topics for 'development session' discussions.</p>	
W.5.18.14	Board Assurance Framework	
	The Board Assurance Framework was discussed as part of agenda item W.5.18.5.	
W.5.18.15	Draft Internal Audit Plan 2018-19	
	<p>JM advised the Committee that Barrie Senior, Chair of the Audit Assurance Committee had requested that the Draft internal Audit Plan 2018-19 was presented to the Workforce Committee to determine if the areas of concern to the Workforce Committee were covered. It was also noted that the Audit Plan would be reviewed at the Finance and Performance Committee and Quality Committee.</p> <p>PV advised that the audit plan covered key areas but that it was flexible. SU asked about recruitment and PC advised that a recruitment audit is undertaken annually – this covers employment check processes and standards.</p> <p>The Committee noted that at the present time there was nothing the Committee required in addition to what was already included.</p>	
W.5.18.16	Any Other Business	
	There were no items.	
W.5.18.17	Matters to share with other committees	
	There were no matters to share with the other committees.	
W.5.18.18	Matters to Escalate to the Corporate Risk Register	

No.	Agenda Item	Action
	There were no matters to escalate to the Corporate Risk Register.	
W.5.18.18	Matters to Escalate to the Board of Directors	
	There were no matters to escalate to the Board of Directors.	
W.5.18.19	Items for Corporate Communications	
	There were no items for corporate communications	
W.5.18.20	Date and time of next meeting	
	Wednesday 25 th July 2018, 11.00 am to 1.00 pm, Conference Room, Field House, Bradford Royal Infirmary	



BRADFORD TEACHING HOSPITALS NHS FOUNDATION TRUST
ACTIONS FROM WORKFORCE COMMITTEE – 28th March 2018

Date of Meeting	Agenda Item	Required Action	Lead	Timescale	Comments/Progress
28.03.18	W.3.18.5	Board Assurance Framework TC advised that the implementation needs embedding more, and the Datix report is being reviewed. A further update will be provided at the next meeting	Director of Governance & Corporate Affairs	Workforce Committee 25 July 2018	The BAF has been reviewed and updated. The report is included on the agenda. <u>Action concluded.</u>
31.01.18	W.1.18.3	Future staff roles – (Minutes of the meeting held on 29 November 2017): PC/BG/KD to produce a paper on future roles to be presented to the Workforce Committee	Director of HR	Workforce Committee 25 July 2018	Item has been added to the agenda.
30.05.18	W.5.18.5	Workforce Committee Dashboard: Arrange meeting with JP to discuss impairment related sickness	Director of HR	Workforce Committee 26 September 2018	JP to contact PC when he is available to attend a meeting.
30.05.18	W.3.18.4	Matters Arising: ‘Harassment and Bullying’ dashboard indicator. PC suggested that the indicator could include the number of <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - complaints logged - complaints resolved informally - formal investigations and outcomes. Due to the small number of complaints it would be appropriate to include within the dashboard on a six monthly cycle.	Director of HR	Workforce Committee 28 November 2018	